

Dylan Robinson, *Hungry Listening: Resonant Theory for Indigenous Sound Studies*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2020. 320 pages. ISBN 978-1-5179-0769-3. \$28.00 USD paperback.

Dylan Robinson is a xwélmexw (Stó:lō/Skwah) scholar and artist, and the Canada Research Chair in Indigenous Arts at Queen's University in Kingston, Ontario. Through his many publications, lectures, and curated projects over more than a decade, he has become a prominent voice internationally in Indigenous arts and decolonization and in sub-disciplines with which that subject intersects. Although the title of this book references sound studies specifically, Robinson's work will resonate with Indigenous and settler scholars and artists who specialize in areas connected to or overlapping with Indigenous studies or sound studies, including ethnomusicology and musicology (my own areas of training) and other subdisciplines of music study.

Broadly, *Hungry Listening: Resonant Theory for Indigenous Sound Studies* provides a cogent theoretical-conceptual framework for studies in sound and music from an Indigenous perspective, a contrasting alternative to the dominant settler colonial model. The phrase "hungry listening" is derived from a combination of two Halq'eméylem words, shxwelítemelh and xwélalà:m, and articulates a central concept of Robinson's theory, that of settler listening positionalities as contrasted with Indigenous listening positionalities. The author describes shxwelítemelh as an adjective for settler or white person's methods or things (or more precisely, starving settler, since many of the settlers encountered by the Stó:lō people during the gold rush were starving), and xwélalà:m, the term for listening. Critical listening positionality is a familiar concept for music scholars, especially for those who focus on the intersection of music with gender, sexuality, class, ability, race, and cultural background; however, Robinson's rigorous examination of Indigenous and settler conceptualizations of listening moves the discussion of critical listening positionalities forward significantly. Furthermore, combining the idea of "hungry" listening positionalities with Leanne Betasamosake Simpson's and Naomi Klein's articulation of extractivism provides a clear framework with which to understand how colonialism has shaped music in Canada and how settler histories of that music have been written. In the same way that 19th-century European composers used folk songs collected from rural communities as raw materials with which to forge national sounds in symphonic works and operas for urban audiences in order to bolster their idea of ethnic nationalism, settler Canadian art music composers have resourced Indigenous sounds in order to craft a Canadian aesthetic throughout much of Canada's colonial history.

Hungry Listening focuses on a series of case studies that emerged from a relatively recent shift in Canada's classical music community. Beginning in the 1990s, rather than continuing to resource Indigenous

sounds as aesthetic raw materials, Indigenous musicians themselves were invited to “collaborate” with classical music ensembles. As Robinson is quick to point out, many of the musical encounters he discusses resulted from funding mandates shaped by Canada’s Multiculturalism Act of 1988 that were then enacted through national, provincial, and local arts councils. Robinson discusses several of these case studies throughout chapters 3, 4, and 5. Chapter 3 addresses contemporary encounters between Indigenous and early music, citing a number of performances in which European art music from before 1750 has been partnered with First Nations and Inuit music, such as Tafelmusik’s project on Vivaldi’s *Four Seasons* with Inuit throat singers and artists from Indian and Chinese traditions, and Camerata Nova’s *Medieval Inuit* concert, a program that combined Nordic folksongs and art music with Inuit throat singing and drum songs. Chapter 4, “Ethnographic Redress, Compositional Responsibility,” begins by addressing the history of ethnographic song collecting from Indigenous communities, then moves to a discussion of classical compositions that incarcerate these songs within their scores, including Harry Somers’ opera *Louis Riel* and Alexina Louie’s *Take the Dog Sled*, and finally explores possible strategies of redress. Chapter 5 examines a number of performances, including some presented as part of the 2010 Vancouver Cultural Olympiad, with a view to interrogating the transformative efficacy of an affective reception (i.e., “feeling reconciliation”) prompted by inclusionary performances with Indigenous artists.

Audiences may have been tempted to view these projects uncritically as a form of reconciliation after a history of extractivist practices in Canada’s classical music community, but simply incorporating Indigenous performers into a settler colonial space, with its own intended protocols of performance and gathering, without attending to the protocols of the Indigenous music culture, is essentially a continuation of colonial extractivism. Looking more closely at these encounters, it is clear that they are not equivalent structurally, and I found Robinson’s taxonomy of musical encounter especially productive in articulating their differences. First, he considers the term “intercultural” as a loose definition of performances resulting from artistic collaborations across cultural difference, but the term is too imprecise to signify the politics of aesthetics inherent in these works. Instead, he adopts the term “inclusionary” to identify performances in which Indigenous artists have been accommodated to fit into classical composition and performance structures, betraying an interest in Indigenous content, but not Indigenous structures. Within this category, the author outlines further models of encounter, including integration, nation-to-nation music trading and reciprocal presentation, and finally, a combination of the two previous models. Robinson counters inclusionary examples with a non-integrative model that he terms “Indigenous+art music,” meant to identify encounters in

which integration is resisted and instead, awkwardness, incompatibility, or irreconcilability might be highlighted.

Throughout *Hungry Listening*, Robinson reminds the reader that both Indigenous content and Indigenous structures are vital considerations in musical encounters between Indigenous and settler composers and performers. Indigenous performers inserted into classical compositional structures, placed in classical music performance spaces with their attendant protocols, and subject to settler perceptual logics does not constitute an artistic negotiation, conciliation, or reconciliation. Robinson encourages attentiveness both to decolonized structures and to decolonial perception by writing about sonic experiences in ways that challenge academic norms. For example, at the end of the introduction, Robinson enacts a textual blockade by exhorting settler readers to pass over the following section titled "Writing Indigenous Space" without reading it and moving forward to Chapter 1. (As this settler reader notes, however, for the blockade to work, the reader must read the book from front to back, rather than jumping between different sections. I am embarrassed to admit that I began reading this section because I did not see the "no trespassing" sign and squeezed through a metaphorical hole in the fence. For that, I sincerely apologize.) Between many of the chapters, the author has inserted "event scores," poetically-written, prescriptive textual scores, which encourage the reader to consider and contemplate the book's central concerns in an alternative way. In the book's conclusion, Robinson invites music scholars Deborah Wong and Ellen Waterman to dialogue as a process to devise decolonial listening strategies.

As a settler scholar constantly navigating between historical musicology and ethnomusicology, trying all the while to address the colonial structures and methodologies of each of those subdisciplines, I found Robinson's book refreshing in its bold creation of a new framework with which to consider Indigenous and classical musics, their encounters with one another, and listening positionalities. This book is densely rich and will resonate differently with a variety of readers, who are likely to find much in it to both challenge and nurture their thinking and practice.

Colette Simonot-Maiello
Desautels Faculty of Music
University of Manitoba

Nicole Dawn Strathman, *Through a Native Lens: American Indian Photography*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2020. 228 pages. ISBN 9780806164847. \$50.00 USD cloth.

Photography has played a significant role in the ongoing relationship between non-Indigenous and Indigenous Peoples in North America